

ENLARGED MEETING OF THE CNRCSA EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
WITH REGIONAL REPRESENTATIVES HELD AT THE SHAPE CLUB
ON WEDNESDAY 25 OCTOBER 2017 AT 09.00 HOURS

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

1. The CHAIRMAN, Mr. O. Guidetti (CNRCSA Chairman), welcomed the participants to this third meeting with Regional Representatives which was held back-to-back with the ANARCP plenary meeting. He welcomed in particular Mr. M. Stevenson (ANARCP), Mr. D. Rait (ANARCP), and Mr. Robertson (ANARCP) who attended for the first time a meeting of the Executive Committee. He extended again his special thanks to the ANARCP Chairman and Secretary for their much appreciated help in organizing this meeting.
2. The CNRCSA SECRETARY, Mr. B. Roden, indicated that apologies for absence had been received from the following members: Mr. J. Devaux (AROF), Mr. R. Goyens (AROF), Mr. A. Grant (ARNS), Mr. G. Franzreb (ANARCP), and Mr. C. Suarez (CNCSC).
3. He further stressed that all documents included in the reference file for the meeting should be considered as classified material and not be widely circulated.
4. The COMMITTEE noted the introductory remarks by the Chairman and the Secretary.

I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Document: CNRCSA(2017)A/3(REV1), dated 18 October 2017

5. The COMMITTEE approved the Agenda with the following changes:
 - II. Elections (subsequent items should be renumbered accordingly);

- Addition of the following items under XVII. Any Other Business: Revision of the Articles of Association/Bye-Laws; Participation to a meeting organized at the European Patent Office HQs by the local Retirees' Association (13 November 2017); Newsletter n° 8.

II. ELECTIONS

References: E-mail from the Secretary, dated 9 October 2017
E-mail from the Chairman, dated 20 October 2017

6. The SECRETARY indicated that the CNRCSA Executive Committee had met earlier at 8.45 hours to elect, in accordance with the Articles of Association and the Bye-Laws, a new Chairman and a new Secretary. It had noted that the present incumbents, although re-eligible, did not wish to stand for re-election.

7. On that basis, the Executive Committee had elected the following members of its Bureau: Mr. H. Rutten (ANARCP), Chairman (end of term November 2019); Mr. O. Guidetti (NOBA), Vice-Chairman (end of term November 2018); Mr. R. Goyens (AROF), Secretary (end of term November 2019).

8. The COMMITTEE took note of the information provided by the Secretary, and also noted that the departing Chairman handed over the chairmanship of the meeting to his successor, Mr. H. Rutten.

III. RECORD OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

Document: CNRCSA(2017)R/2, dated 16 August 2017, approved on 1 September 2017

9. The COMMITTEE noted that the record of its previous meeting had been approved under a silence procedure ending on 1 September 2017.

IV. FOLLOW-UP TO DECISIONS MADE

Document: Annex B to CNRCSA(2017)R/2, dated 16 August 2017

10. The COMMITTEE noted that all decisions made at the previous meeting had been followed-up, with the exception of action items 1/8, 2/9, 7/18, and 9/34 on which further information would be provided during the meeting.

V. APPOINTMENTS TO THE (ENLARGED) EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE/RESIGNATIONS

References: E-mail from Mr. D. Manocha, dated 1 June 2017
E-mail from Mr. P. Ludford, dated 27 June 2017
E-mail from F. Bülling, dated 3 August 2017
E-mail from Mrs. A. Egribozlu, dated 27 September 2017
Mr. S. Acar's CV
Mr. Y. Güçer's CV

11. The COMMITTEE took note of the resignations of Mr. D. Manocha (Regional Representative for the United Kingdom) and of Mrs. A. Egribozlu (Regional Representative for Turkey), thanked them for their commitment and contributions to the work of the Committee, and wished them well for the future.

12. The COMMITTEE formally appointed the following new Regional Representatives: Mr. M. Stevenson (ANARCP) for Belgium, and Mr. D. Rait (ANARCP) for the United Kingdom.

13. The COMMITTEE also appointed Mr. S. Acar (Regional Representative for Turkey) on the understanding that he would be designated in the afternoon by the ANARCP Plenary Committee as National Delegate for Turkey. It further tasked the Chairman to send a letter of congratulations to the new incumbents (**Action 1**).

14. The COMMITTEE further noted that, according to Mr. P. Ludford (ANARCP), the CNCRSA should in future designate and appoint its own Regional Representatives and no longer rely on the constituent Associations for doing so. The present ad hoc arrangements for financing their travel and missions would remain unchanged.

VI. FINANCIAL MATTERS

(a) 2016 Financial Situation

Reference: Situation financière de 2016, document drafted by the Treasurer

15. The COMMITTEE took note of the verbal report by the Treasurer and approved, without comments, the 2016 Financial Situation.

(b) 2018 Draft Budget

Reference: CNRCSA Budget 2018, document drafted by the Treasurer

16. The COMMITTEE approved, without comments, the 2018 Draft Budget.

(c) NATO 2017 Subsidy

Reference: EM(2017)0406, dated 4 September 2017

17. The COMMITTEE was informed by the Treasurer that Mr. W. Bush, ASG for Executive Management, had approved the payment of the NATO 2017 subsidy to the CNRCSA.

(d) Travel Reimbursement Policy

18. The COMMITTEE noted that the Treasurer would draft an updated travel reimbursement policy taking into account the comments received (**Action 2**).

VII. REORGANIZATION OF THE CNRCSA STRUCTURE AND WORKING METHODS

(a) Yearly CNRCSA General Assembly

Reference: Action item 6/14, Annex B (CNRCSA(2017)R/2

19. The COMMITTEE agreed, taking into account the Bureau's advice, that the proposal to hold a yearly CNRCSA General Assembly should not be followed up.

(b) Regional Representatives' Revised Terms of Reference

References: E-mails from Mr. B. Roden, dated 12 September and 9 October 2017
E-mail from Mr. R. Goyens, dated 26 September 2017

20. The COMMITTEE noted that AROF had broken silence on the revised TORs, as drafted by the Bureau, and tasked its Ad hoc Working Group to further discuss AROF's proposals and to report back at its next meeting (**Action 3**).

(c) CNRCSA Membership Application Form

Reference: E-mail from Mr. M. Geeraerts, dated 11 October 2017

21. The COMMITTEE took note of the progress report by Mr. Geeraerts and tasked the Expert Team to organize a teleconference via Skype with the Associations' Treasurers and Secretaries in order to finalize the application form, taking into account the last comments received (**Action 4**).

22. The COMMITTEE also tasked the Associations' Secretaries to provide their updated membership data bases to Mr. L. Daykin (ANARCP) who would integrate them into a single CNRCSA data base (**Action 5**).

VIII. HEALTH INSURANCE MATTERS

(a) Meeting of the JCB Working Group on Medical Insurance Matters held on 27 June 2017

Document: JCB-WP(2017)0002, dated 28 July 2017

23. The COMMITTEE noted that the Joint Consultative Board (JCB) had approved the following actions as recommended by its Working Group:

1. NATO IS would develop a Programme of Work focused on financing, preventive actions and staff information, supplement B in Germany, medical expenses in the United States.

2. AWC would discuss with doctors and handle the case management to reduce the internal price applied to NATO staff in Luxembourg.

3. NATO IS/AWC would distribute an e-form to all beneficiaries (using AWC) concerning the primary insurance. Before action would be taken on this issue, NATO Bodies would be informed first (e.g. via an office notice). In addition, AWC would update the database accordingly.

4. AWC would continue work to address the administrative problems encountered in countries such as Turkey and Italy to obtain the necessary documentation to comply with the primary insurance principles.

5. CNCSC would continue to work on the harmonization of the supplementary insurance across the Organization.

6. AWC would enforce the fraud detection system.

7. NATO IS would provide statistics on fraud investigations done for NATO (number of cases reviewed as suspicious, savings from the reviewed cases, cases closed with an outcome of fraud, etc.).

(b) Delays in claims handling and reimbursement by AWC

24. The COMMITTEE noted that NATO IS, in accordance with the NATO Group Insurance Contract, had imposed a penalty to AWC of EUR 250 per day since 15 April 2017. AWC had since then taken remedial measures, one of which was the recruitment of additional staff.

(c) Harmonization of NATO-wide Supplementary Insurance

Reference: E-mail from Mr. F.Bülling, dated 22 June 2017

25. The COMMITTEE noted that the CNCSC had not yet reached an agreement on the harmonization of the coverage and premiums corresponding to the various Supplements of the NWS.

26. The CHAIRMAN indicated that the NWS had been contracted, in accordance with the CPRs, by the CNCSC for the benefit of both active and retired staff at a time when the CNRCSA did not exist. Circumstances had changed since then and he felt that the Confederation should now be fully involved in the future harmonization discussions alongside the CNCSC. He would contact his CNCSC counterpart on the subject (**Action 6**).¹

(d) CNCSC Group Insurance Policy Working Group

Reference: Slides of the presentation made at the CNCSC Executive Committee Meeting held on 10_11 October 2017

27. The COMMITTEE reviewed with interest the slides presented at the subject meeting.

(e) CNRCSA WG on Health Insurances/Chairperson

28. The COMMITTEE formally appointed Mrs. I. Tezcan (ARNS) as Chairperson of its Working Group on Health Insurances and as CNRCSA lead representative to the JCB Working Group on Medical Insurance Matters.

IX. COMPLAINTS AND APPEALS PROCEDURES

(a) Meeting of the JCB Working Group on Complaints and Appeals held on 20 September 2017

Document: JCB-WP(2017)0007, dated 2 October 2017

Reference: CNRCSA(2017)0002, dated 12 September 2017

29. The COMMITTEE noted with regret that the CNRCSA request to postpone the meeting to another date when its representatives could attend had been turned down. It reaffirmed its position, as expressed in a letter sent by the past Chairman to the JCB Chairman, that the NATO complaints and appeals procedures enshrined in the CPRs could not and should not, in present circumstances, apply to the retirees which should be allowed to lodge directly their complaints/appeals to the Administrative Tribunal.

¹ The Chairman has sent an email to the CNCSC Chairman on this subject and has received a positive answer.

30. The COMMITTEE reaffirmed also that the CNRCSA would contribute, alongside the CNCSC and with other supportive members of the JCB, to a fundamental review of the Administrative Tribunal.

31. The COMMITTEE tasked its Bureau to draft, after the next meeting of the JCB Working Group in December, proposed amendments to the CPRs to reflect the CNRCSA position (**Action 7**).

X. CHANGE TO FOOTNOTE TO ARTICLE 51.2 OF THE CPRs/APPEAL

Reference: Oral update by the Secretary

32. The COMMITTEE was informed by the Secretary that the retired complainant's appeal had now been duly registered by the Administrative Tribunal's Registrar and, once the Secretary General's observations would have been received and answered to, a hearing could be expected to take place in early spring 2018.

XI. JOINT CONSULTATIVE BOARD

(a) JCB meeting held on 29 June 2017

References: Report by Mr. H. Rutten, CNRCSA Lead Representative to the JCB
Letter to the Secretary General co-signed by the CNCSC and CNRCSA Chairmen, dated 19 July 2017
Letter from the Secretary General (SG(2017)0233, dated 23 August 2017)

33. The COMMITTEE took note of the report by the CNRCSA lead representative on the subject meeting.

(b) JCB meeting held on 19 October 2017

Document: JCB-A(2017)0003(REV2), dated 16 October 2017

References: E-mail from Mr. H. Rutten, dated 26 September 2017
Report by Mr. H. Rutten, CNRCSA Lead Representative to the JCB

34. The COMMITTEE was informed by its lead representative that it had been confirmed at the subject meeting that the NATO complaints and appeals procedures could not be resorted to for NGIC/AWC- related disputes and that only Article 7 of the NGIC was applicable in such circumstances. The JCB Secretary had provided a link from which both active and retired staff could download the full text of the article.

35. The SECRETARY recalled that an all-inclusive information process had been agreed with the Pension Unit whereby all retirees- “connected and unconnected” – would be systematically informed on all matters of direct relevance to them. He would ask the JCB Secretary to follow that procedure (**Action 8**).

XII. RMCF

(a) Meetings of the RMCF Steering Committee held on 28 September and 19 October 2017

References: Reports by the CNRCSA Representatives
Update briefing prepared by the CNCSC RMCF Working Group for the CNCSC Executive Committee meeting held on 10-11 October 2017

36. The COMMITTEE took note of the reports of the CNRCSA representatives on the subject meetings, indicating that the Steering Committee report would be circulated to the Budget Committee before the end of the year. It shared their views that the evolution of the Fund did not justify compulsory contributions by the retirees to the RMCF, that it should however be closely monitored without raising undue concerns among Nations as to its future, and that the International Service of Remuneration and Pensions (ISRP) should be tasked with undertaking another actuarial study which should better integrate the changing NATO demographics.

XIII. MEETING OF THE CNCSC EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE HELD ON 10-11 OCTOBER 2017

Reference: Oral report by the CNRCSA Chairman

37. The COMMITTEE took note of the oral report by its former Chairman on the subject meeting.

XIV. CCR-RELATED MATTERS

(a) Annual Adjustment of Remuneration at 1 January 2018

Document: CCR/CRSG/CRP/WD(2017)17, dated 14 September 2017

38. The COMMITTEE noted that the recommended adjustment had been agreed at CCR level and that it would be submitted to the NATO Council for approval in the coming weeks.

(b) Co-ordination Meetings in June 2017

References: CRP Review, n° 10, June 2017
Revue du CRP, n°11, September 2017

39. The COMMITTEE noted that the CCR had put on its work agenda, for 2018, a holistic review of the 1974 Co-ordinated Pension Scheme focused on: retirement age, fiscal adjustment, pension accumulation rate, contribution shares (staff/Organizations), type of remuneration to be used for pension calculation.

XV. CNRCSA REGIONAL REPRESENTATIVES' ANNUAL REPORTS

Reference: Updated list of Regional Representatives

40. The COMMITTEE took note of the subject reports and tasked again the Associations' Secretaries to provide Regional Representatives with updated versions of their membership data bases (**Action 9**).

XVI. AAPOCAD GOVERNING BOARD MEETING HELD ON 13 OCTOBER 2017

Reference: Update report by the Secretary

41. The COMMITTEE was informed by the Secretary that Mr. J. Parsons had been elected as the new AAPOCAD Chairman and that he would, in the coming weeks, contact a number of international organizations to sound their willingness to hold the second Conference of Retirees' Associations of Inter-governmental Organizations.

XVII. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

(a) Revision of the Articles of Association/Bye-Laws

42. The COMMITTEE tasked the Bureau to establish a a small Working Group in order to clean up and update certain sections of the Articles of Association (if required) and Bye-Laws and to report back at the next meeting (**Action 10**).

(b) CNRCSA representation at a meeting organized by the European Patent Office in The Hague (13 November 2017)

43. The COMMITTEE appointed Mr. J.Batstra, Mr. M. Stevenson, and Mr. B.Roden to represent the CNRCSA at the meeting which would focus on taxation problems and on the roles, powers and organization of retirees' associations.

(c) Newsletter N°8

44. The COMMITTEE tasked the Bureau to draft Newsletter N°8 before the end of the year (**Action 11**).

XVIII. DATE AND PLACE OF THE NEXT ENLARGED MEETING

45. To be determined.

Billy Roden

Distribution:

- Members of the Executive Committee
- Regional Representatives and Deputies

After approval of the record:

- Chairman, Confederation of NATO Civilian Staff Committees (CNCSC)
- Mr. Parsons, Chairman of AAPOCAD
- Mr. Bigaignon, Editor of the NATO Staff Bulletin

ATTENDANCE LIST

- ARNS: E. Marquenie (Treasurer), P. Emmett, G. Malet, I. Tezcan
B.Roden (Secretary), M. Geeraerts
- ANARCP: F. Bülling, H.Rutten (Vice- Chairman/Chairman), P. Ludford, J. Delor
L. Daykin, K. van den Broek, J. Vanderwal
- NOBA: C. Baretti, O. Guidetti (Chairman/Vice-Chairman), D. Schoder, I. Warschburger
- AROF: R. Hickman, J-M Torrès
- REGIONAL REPRESENTATIVES/Deputies: V. Arzeni, D. Rait, M. Stevenson, D. Degrotte
A. Egribozlu, J.F. Eiken, G.I. Thorsen, P. Wilmotte,
J. Batstra, G. Robertson

LIST OF ACTION ITEMS

<u>No./paragraph</u>	<u>Subject</u>	<u>By whom</u>
1/13	Send a letter of congratulations to new Regional Representatives and Deputies	Chairman
2/18	Update travel reimbursement policy	Treasurer
3/20	Discuss AROF proposals on Regional Reps revised TORs	AHWG
4/21	Finalize membership application form via Skype teleconference	Expert Team
5/22	Send updated membership data bases to Mr. L. Daykin	Associations' Secretaries representatives (JCB/JCB WG)
6/26	Contact CNCSC Chairman on NWS harmonization	Chairman
7/31	Draft proposed amendments to CPRs (complaints and appeals procedures)	Bureau
8/35	Ask JCB Secretary to inform all retirees on article 7 (NGIC)	Secretary
9/40	Provide Regional representatives with updated membership data bases	Associations' Secretaries
10/42	Establish a small Working Group to clean up/update Articles of Association/Bye-Laws	Bureau
11/44	Draft Newsletter N°8	Bureau