

ORIGINAL: FRENCH

MEETING OF THE CONFEDERATION OF NATO RETIRED CIVILIAN STAFF ASSOCIATIONS  
(CNRCSA) EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, HELD AT NATO HEADQUARTERS (LANGE CONFERENCE  
ROOM) ON TUESDAY, 5 JULY 2016 AT 10 A.M.

I. INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

1. The VICE-CHAIRMAN, Mr RUTTEN, welcomed the participants, and in particular Mrs SCHODER (NOBA) and Mr HICKMAN (AROF), who were attending their first Executive Committee meeting. He was also pleased to see Mr SUAREZ (CNCSC) at the meeting, a sign of the good relationship that the CNRSCA now had with the Confederation of NATO Civilian Staff Committees.

2. The COMMITTEE noted the Vice-Chairman's introductory comments.

II. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Document: CNRCSA(2016)A/2 dated 20 June 2016

3. The COMMITTEE adopted the agenda after adding the following items to Any Other Business: future of the CNCSA and role of its constituent associations; payment of individual contributions directly to the CNRCSA.

III. RECORD OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

Document: CNRCSA(2016)R/1, dated 29 April 2016

4. The COMMITTEE noted that the record had been approved under a silence procedure ending on 13 May 2016.

#### IV. FOLLOW-UP TO DECISIONS TAKEN

Document: Annex B to CNRCSA(2016)R/1, dated 29 April 2016

5. The COMMITTEE noted that most of the actions approved at the previous meeting had been followed up; those that were pending (see item II.3) would be discussed in the meeting.

#### V. FINANCIAL MATTERS

##### (a) 2016 budget/call for contributions

6. The TREASURER, Mr MARQUENIE, said that the Confederation's constituent associations had been asked to pay their 2016 contributions (2 euros per member), and that a satisfactory solution had been found for transferring the contributions of AROF and NOBA.

7. In addition, he said that Executive Management had undertaken to raise NATO's annual subsidy to €14,000 after 2016.

##### (b) Meeting of Treasurers held on 24 June 2016

Reference: Mr Marquenie's e-mail of 17 June 2016

8. Mr MARQUENIE reported on the highly constructive meeting with the associations' treasurers at which the following business had been discussed: harmonization and computerization of the associations' accounting procedures with reference to the CNRCSA model, choice of the most advantageous legal status for the associations from a tax standpoint (for instance ARNS was now a NATO entity), account auditing procedures.

9. The COMMITTEE noted the Treasurer's verbal report and agreed, given the various opinions expressed in the meeting, to continue discussing the following matters at its next meeting: advisability of doing away with the ANARCP system of national delegates, which overlapped with the CNRCSA's (while acknowledging that there was a budgetary advantage to having some missions funded by SHAPE) and NATO's budgeting for the mission costs of CNRCSA Bureau members, as was done for the CNCSC (**Action 1**).

#### VI. RETIREES' MEDICAL CLAIM FUND (RMCF)

References: Mr Roden's e-mail of 15 November 2015  
Mr Marquenie's e-mail of 7 April 2016  
Mr Malet's e-mail of 3 June 2016  
Mrs Gerrie's e-mail of 29 May 2016  
Mr Bülling's e-mail of 31 May 2016

10. The EXECUTIVE SECRETARY, Mr RODEN, said that the CNRCSA Bureau had further examined the answers given by the SIRP actuaries in a telephone conversation on 8 March 2016, and had agreed to inform the Chairman of the RMCF Supervisory Board of the following information, which should be added to the next version of the biennial actuarial study:

- taking the situation at the end of 2016 as the starting point for the statistical data;
- drawing a distinction between retirees in the coordinated system and in the DCPS; for this, several scenarios for the proportion of retirees in the DCPS who were receiving (or would probably receive) RMCF coverage should be incorporated into the study;
- examining the assumptions about decreased expenditure from the Fund as a result of greater recourse to national social security systems.

11. The Executive Secretary also stressed the necessity of working in close cooperation with the representatives of the CNCSC and Personnel Support Services.

12. The COMMITTEE noted the Executive Secretary's statement.

#### VII. CHANGE TO THE FOOTNOTE TO ARTICLE 51.2 OF THE CPR

##### (a) Complaints

References: Mr Roden's e-mails of 15 April and 1 May 2016  
Mr Wilmotte's e-mail of 2 May 2016  
draft complaint (NAEW&C Force) dated 2 March 2016  
Mr Bülling's e-mail of 20 May 2016  
verbal report by the Executive Secretary

13. The EXECUTIVE SECRETARY confirmed that seven complaints had been sent to the CNRCSA Secretariat. In accordance with the Committee's decision to provide financial support for a complaint and to hire a lawyer for that purpose, Mr G. Palmieri, former chairman of the CRP, had been tasked with drafting the complaint, which had then been forwarded to the Secretary General within the prescribed time frame.

14. The COMMITTEE noted the information provided by the Executive Secretary and tasked him with sending an English version of the complaint to the Committee members **(Action 2)**.

#### VIII. UPDATE ON HEALTH INSURANCE MATTERS

15. Mr BULLING, Chairman of the CNRCSA Working Group on Insurance Matters, provided further information about some matters that had not necessarily been discussed in the constituent associations' general assemblies.

##### (a) Loss of independence/dependence (Long-term care)

References: Mr Batstra's e-mail of 2 May 2016  
Mr Bülling's e-mail of 3 May 2016

- the CNRCSA representatives would continue their efforts in the JCB's working group on this so that non-medical aspects were bundled into home care.

(b) Outstanding claims

References: Mr Bülling's e-mails of 11 April, 28 April and 12 May 2016  
Mr Schoenmakers' e-mail of 11 April 2016

- AWC services assigned a different reference number to each stage of processing a claim that was disputed or required further information, which was confusing. Unfortunately this system could not be changed.

(c) Survivor's pension

References: Mr Bülling's e-mails of 22 and 25 March 2016

- The surviving spouse of a staff member who had served for fewer than 25 years at the time of death would, in order to receive medical coverage, be required to pay a premium amounting to 1.67% of the staff member's last salary, plus the supplementary insurance premium. This might give rise to troublesome situations, since survivor's pensions were lower than retirement pensions and were taxable.

(d) Permanent invalidity

Mr Bülling's e-mails of 3 April, 10 April, 3 May, 1 June and 18 June 2016

- Confirmation was provided that workplace accidents and occupational illnesses were covered by AWC.

(e) AWC's NATO Benefit Guide

References: Mr Bülling's e-mails of 20 November and 27 December 2013 and 10, 11, 13, 15 and 17 June 2016  
Mrs Mansouri's e-mails of 10 and 27 December 2013  
Mr Schoenmakers' e-mail of 10 June 2016  
Mr Ludford's e-mail of 11 June 2016  
Mr Neitzel's e-mail of 13 June 2016  
Mrs Brems' e-mail of 13 June 2016  
Mr Guidetti's e-mail of 14 June 2016  
Mr Franzreb's e-mail of 15 June 2016  
Mrs Smets' e-mail of 16 June 2016

- The Administration and AWC had not met their commitment to provide a paper copy of the revised Guide for all retirees, some of whom had received both the electronic version and the paper one, whereas others had only received the electronic version. This revealed some shortcomings in the AWC address systems. AWC would send a paper version, in English and French, by mail free of charge to any retirees who requested one.

(f) NATO-wide implementation guidelines for the insurance policy

References: Mr Bülling's e-mails of 19 and 25 March and 10 and 11 June 2016  
Mr Viellemand's e-mail of 21 March 2016  
Mr Schoenmakers' e-mail of 9 June 2016  
Mrs Smets' e-mail of 10 June 2016

- The implementation guidelines had been modified and were already being applied by the Administration, in violation of the established procedure of first consulting with the relevant JCB working group (in which both serving and retired staff were represented) and the JCB subsequently approving the modifications.

(g) Double insurance

References: Mr Bülling's e-mail of 30 May 2016  
Mr Arzeni's e-mail of 31 May 2016  
Mr Goyens' e-mail of 2 June 2016  
Mrs Jensen's e-mail of 2 June 2016

- Some retirees who were paying for private health insurance coverage might think it overlapped with NATO's supplementary insurance. They were advised, however, to take a very close look at the clauses in their policy before cancelling their supplementary insurance. Cancellation was, in any event, irrevocable.

(h) Joint meeting of the CNCSC Group Insurance Policy Working Group and the CNRCSA Working Group on Insurance Matters

References: Mr Hooijdonk's e-mails of 10 February and 12 May 2016 and  
Mr Bülling's e-mails of 17 March and 9 May 2016  
Mr Bülling's update

- This first meeting, which lasted two hours, had been highly productive and had highlighted topics of common interest that would be discussed at other meetings.

(i) Executive Committee visit to AWC Brussels offices (4 July 2016)

References: Mr Roden's e-mails of 13 April and 31 May 2016  
Mr Bülling's e-mails of 20 March, 11 April and 14 and 20 May 2016  
Mrs Brems' e-mails of 15 April and 27 May 2016  
medical conciliation process and arbitration procedures  
Mrs De Cauwer's e-mail of 20 May 2016

- This visit was marked by a constructive atmosphere and valuable insights. The members received very thorough information about the various steps in the process of logging and processing claims, how the service that answered telephone calls operated, and the role of the medical service. A joint working session addressed the following topics: internal complaints procedures at AWC, the direct billing system, the rules on power of attorney, and the terms of AWC's coverage of invalidity.

(j) Relations with Executive Management and Personnel Support Services

- These relations were unsatisfactory and still highly problematic. Since CNRCSA representatives were not getting verbal or written answers to the questions they put to the Administration, they were unable to play their acknowledged role in NATO's various representative bodies or best defend the retirees' interests.

16. The COMMITTEE noted the updated information from Mr Bülling and tasked its representatives with raising the question of relations with the Administration at the next JCB meeting (**Action 3**).

IX. JOINT CONSULTATIVE BOARD (JCB)

(a) JCB meeting on 17 March 2016

Reference: Mr Facey's report of 19 March 2016

17. The COMMITTEE noted the report at reference.

(b) JCB meeting scheduled for 7 July 2016

- Education allowance

18. The COMMITTEE noted that the CNCSC representatives would voice their opposition to the fact that some administrations wanted to deduct scholarships and student loans from the education allowance.

- Medical arbitration

19. The COMMITTEE noted that the CNCSC representatives would insist on strict respect for the time frames for medical arbitration proceedings, because arbitration was taking place far too long after a disputed decision by the NATO Medical Adviser.

- Access to Personnel Support Services data (revision of the supplementary insurance policy)

20. The COMMITTEE shared the concerns of the CNCSC, which could not suggest changes to the supplementary insurance policy that it had taken out on the staff's behalf unless it received the necessary data from the Administration. The Committee reaffirmed that while

the CNCSC was not legally the underwriter of that insurance, it did have a traditional role to play in this, with the support of the CNRCSA, and its role had to be played within the relevant JCB working group.

- Revision of the salary adjustment method

21. The COMMITTEE noted the information provided by Mr SUAREZ about the revision of the method. The CCR had recently put forward a proposal aimed at getting a CRSG-CRP consensus on a new adjustment method, which could then enter into force on 1 January 2017. The CRSG and CRP remained opposed to the inclusion of a new wage restraint clause on top of the affordability clause, however, because that would mean abandoning the principle of parallelism with the national civil services. If no agreement could be reached, the current method would be renewed for two years.

- JCB Working Group on complaints and appeals

Document: JCB-WP(2016)0003, dated 14 June 2016

22. The COMMITTEE noted the Vice-Chairman's report on the JCB Working Group meeting held on 10 June 2016. CNRCSA and CNCSC representatives said that they would work together on a substantial reform of the complaints and appeals procedure. Should the administrations be unable to approve such a reform, the CNRCSA would ask that the former procedure be reinstated just for the retirees.

- Civil registered partnerships

Document: JCB-WP(2014)0111-REV1 dated 23 February 2016

References: Mr Bülling's e-mails of 16 and 20 June 2015

Mr Stokes' e-mails of 19 June 2015 and 17 March 2016

Mr Facey's e-mail of 18 March 2016

letter from Mr Facey to Mr Bush of 1 May 2015

23. The COMMITTEE tasked the CNRCSA representatives with raising the issue, at the JCB's next meeting, of the CPR provisions on civil registered partnerships and their impact on retirees, and with stressing that NATO could not substitute its own rules for the relevant international and common law (**Action 4**).

X. SINGLE SALARY SPINE

Document: JCB-WP(2016)0290, dated 4 May 2016

References: Mr Roden's e-mail of 6 May 2016

Mr Bülling's e-mail of 7 May 2016

Mr Rutten's e-mail of 7 May 2016

24. The COMMITTEE asked the CNRCSA representatives to check, at the JCB's next meeting, that the compromise language on the CNRCSA's stance on the single salary spine expressed to the Working Group was in fact included in the Chairman's report to the Secretary General (**Action 5**).

XI. DEFINED CONTRIBUTION PENSION SCHEME (DCPS)

(a) DCPS Management Board meeting on 9 June 2016

Reference: Mr Marquenie's verbal report

25. The COMMITTEE noted the information provided by Mr MARQUENIE about the proposals for improvements to the DCPS that were under review and aimed to offer a more advantageous pension scheme for staff on longer-term contracts. The envisaged system would have two pillars: one with a safety net and the other with defined contributions. It would offer a better division of responsibilities between NATO and affiliates, with pooled funds that would be entrusted to a manager (to be chosen).

26. The COMMITTEE also noted the CNCSC representative's viewpoint that the improved DCPS could not be considered a true pension scheme, and that the pillar with the safety net was fully funded by the staff member. The benefits and the rate of return on the funds meant that the DCPS was far behind the schemes of other international organizations.

XII. NATO ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Document: 2015 Annual Report (AT(TRI)(2016)0001)

27. The COMMITTEE observed that the Tribunal President had explicitly admitted to a sense of powerlessness in its annual report insofar as the Tribunal's jurisdiction was very much limited by the Council, which would lead complainants to turn more and more often to the civil courts to assert their rights.

XIII. BARDET/NSPA CASE

References: Mr Guidetti's e-mails of 7 and 8 June 2016  
Mr Roden's e-mails of 7 and 8 June 2016  
Mr Rutten's e-mails of 7 and 8 June 2016  
Mr Reichl's e-mail of 8 June 2016  
Mr Bülling's e-mail of 8 June 2016

28. The COMMITTEE was informed about the appeal lodged by Mr Bardet with the Administrative Tribunal as well as the follow-up to it, which confirmed the Tribunal's limited jurisdiction. Given that the complainant was a retiree but was not a member of any of the NATO retirees' associations and had not made any request for the CNRCSA's involvement, the Committee decided against following up on this case.



XIV. MEETING OF THE CNCSC EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE IN BOLOGNA ON 14–15 JUNE 2016

Reference: Chairman's report

29. The COMMITTEE noted the Chairman's report on the above-mentioned meeting.

XV. MEETING WITH THE DEPUTY SECRETARY GENERAL ON 16 MARCH 2016

Reference: verbal report by the Executive Secretary

30. The COMMITTEE noted the Executive Secretary's report on this meeting, which the Assistant Secretary General for Executive Management had attended and at which the various topics that the Committee had set out at its meeting on 16 March 2016 had been discussed (see CNRCSA(2016)R/1, item XV).

XVI. CNRCSA WEBSITE

References: Mr Bülling's e-mail of 27 May 2016  
draft general policy on websites (circulated in the meeting)

31. The COMMITTEE noted the draft general policy prepared by Mr Grant, in charge of the CNRCSA website, and tasked him with holding a meeting with the other people in charge of the associations' websites to continue discussing this policy (**Action 6**).

XVII. APPOINTMENTS TO THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE/DESIGNATION OF CNRCSA REPRESENTATIVES

32. The COMMITTEE:

- noted that Mr Facey had stepped down from his ARNS duties, and that Mr Malet (ARNS) was replacing him;

- unanimously agreed to appoint Mrs Tezcan (ARNS) to join them in view of her expertise and her understanding of the issues addressed by the CNRCSA;

- noted that Mr Aktuglu (ANARCP) was stepping down and being replaced by Mrs Egribozlu (ANARCP) as the CNRCSA's regional representative for Turkey;

- confirmed the appointment of Mr Rutten as the CNRCSA's main representative to the JCB as a replacement for Mr Facey, and designated Mr Roden as an alternate representative.

XVIII. FAREWELL TO MR DAVID FACEY

33. The VICE-CHAIRMAN read the following statement on behalf of Mr. Guidetti, Chairman of the CNRCSA: "When David informed me of his decision to retire from the Confederation, I fully understood and respected his wish, but on the other hand we are all deeply affected by his departure. Fortunately, David has offered to continue to provide us with his competent advices whenever he would feel the need. I think it is no secret to any of us the huge and excellent work performed by David during almost twenty years. David, I want to thank you very much indeed and wish you all the best in your future life. On behalf of the Committee, I have the great honour to offer you this gift, symbol of our deep appreciation".

34. The COMMITTEE joined the Vice-Chairman in expressing their gratitude to Mr Facey as they bade him farewell, and thanked him for his eminent contribution over many years to the work of the Confederation, of which he was the founding father.

35. The COMMITTEE decided unanimously to confer the status of honorary member on Mr Facey.

XIX. CPR CHANGE PROPOSAL

Reference: Mr Arzeni's e-mail of 20 June 2016

36. The COMMITTEE noted the changes that Mr Arzeni suggested making to the text of the Rules of the Coordinated Pension Scheme of 1974, as annexed to the CPR. In the Committee's view, however, this matter fell outside its jurisdiction but within that of the CRP, so it tasked its representatives with presenting the proposals at the next meeting of the AAPOCAD Governing Board in Paris.

XX. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

37. The COMMITTEE tasked the Executive Secretary with convening the Ad Hoc Working Group on revision of the CNRCSA's structures and working methods to discuss the following matters further: future of the CNCSA and role of its constituent associations; payment of individual contributions directly to the CNRCSA. In addition the Committee tasked it with reporting on this at its next meeting (**Action 7**).

XXI. DATE AND LOCATION OF NEXT MEETING

38. The COMMITTEE decided to hold its next meeting with regional representatives on 19 October 2016 (to be confirmed) at SHAPE.

Billy Roden  
CNRCSA Executive Secretary

### Distribution

Mr Delor, Mr Emmett, Mr Facey, Mr Goyens, Mr Hickman, Mrs Tezcan, Mr Grant, Mr Malet, Mr Marquenie, Mr Roden, Mr Bülling, Mr Ludford, Mr Rutten, Mrs Baretti, Mrs Schoder, Mr Guidetti, Mrs Waerschburger, Mr Devaux, Mr Neitzel, Mr Arzeni, Mr Manocha, Mr Vanderwal, Mrs Egribozlu , Mrs Jensen, Mr Eiken, Mr Wilmotte, Mr Batstra, Mr Franzreb.

After approval of the record:

- Chairman of the Confederation of NATO Civilian Staff Committees (CNCSC)
- Mr Wacquez, AAPOCAD Chairman
- Mr Bigaignon, Editor of the NATO Staff Bulletin

ATTENDANCE LIST

ARNS: D. Facey, E. Marquenie (Treasurer), P. Emmett, B. Roden (Executive Secretary)

ANARCP: F. Bülling, H. Rutten (Vice-Chairman), P. Ludford, J. Delor

NOBA: D. Schoder, I. Waerschburger

AROF: R. Goyens, R. Hickman

**ACTION LIST**

<u>No./paragraph</u>	<u>Subject</u>	<u>By whom</u>
1/9	Place financial and budgetary matters on the agenda of the next meeting	Executive Secretary
2/14	Send out the English version of the complaint against the change to the footnote to Article 51.2	Executive Secretary
3/16	Raise the issue of problematic relations with the Administration in the JCB	CNRCSA representatives to the JCB
4/23	Raise the issue of the provisions on civil registered partnerships in the JCB	CNRCSA representatives to the JCB
5/24	Check, in the JCB, that the CNRCSA's stance on the single salary spine was included in the report to the Secretary General	CNRCSA representatives to the JCB
6/31	Hold a meeting with the people in charge of the other websites	Mr Grant
7/36	Convene the Ad Hoc Working Group on revision of the CNRCSA's structures and working methods	Executive Secretary