



CONFEDERATION DES ASSOCIATIONS DE RETRAITES DE L'OTAN  
CONFEDERATION OF NATO RETIRED CIVILIAN STAFF ASSOCIATIONS

Sous la présidence d'honneur de  
Monsieur le Secrétaire Général de l'OTAN

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

CNRCSA(2016)R/3(REV1)  
2 December 2016

ENLARGED MEETING OF THE CNRCSA EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE  
WITH REGIONAL REPRESENTATIVES HELD AT THE SHAPE CLUB  
ON WEDNESDAY 19 OCTOBER 2016 AT 09.00 HOURS

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

1. The CHAIRMAN, Mr. O. Guidetti (CNRCSA Chairman), welcomed the participants to this second meeting with regional representatives which was held back-to-back with the ANARCP Plenary meeting. He welcomed in particular Mrs. I. Tezcan (ARNS), Mr. G. Malet (ARNS), Mr. M. Geeraerts (ARNS), Mr. L. Daykin (ANARCP), Mr. G. L. Thorsen (ANARCP), Mr. T. Hammargren (ANARCP), Mr. K. van den Broek (ANARCP), and Ms. A. Egribozlu (ANARCP) who attended for the first time a meeting of the Executive Committee. He extended his special thanks to the ANARCP Chairman and Secretary for their much appreciated help in organizing this meeting.
2. The CNRCSA SECRETARY, Mr. B. Roden, indicated that apologies for absence had been received from the following members: Mr. J. Devaux (AROF), Mr. R. Goyens (AROF), Mr. A. Grant (ARNS), Mrs. I. Waerschburger (NOBA), and Mr. J. F. Eiken (ANARCP).
3. He further stressed that all documents included in the reference file for the meeting should be considered as classified material and not be widely circulated.
4. The COMMITTEE noted the introductory remarks by the Chairman and the Secretary.

I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Document: CNRCSA(2016)A/3, dated 4 October 2016

5. The COMMITTEE approved the Agenda with the following change: "V.a Draft 2017 Budget".

## II. RECORD OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

Document: CNRCSA(2016)R/2, dated 16 August 2016, approved on 31 August 2016

6. The COMMITTEE noted that the record of its previous meeting had been approved under a silence procedure ending on 31 August 2016.

## III. FOLLOW-UP TO DECISIONS MADE

Document: Annex B to CNRCSA(2016)R/2, dated 16 August 2016

7. The COMMITTEE noted that all decisions made at the previous meeting had been followed-up, with the exception of action item 6/31 (Meeting of Associations' webmasters) on which further information would be provided later in the meeting.

## IV. APPOINTMENTS TO THE (ENLARGED) EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE/RESIGNATIONS

References: E-mail from Ms. L. Hoffmann Jensen, dated 26 August 2016  
E-mail from Mr. F. Bülling, dated 27 August 2016  
E-mail from Mr. P. Ludford, dated 11 August 2016  
E-mail from Mr. A. Aktuglu, dated 7 May 2016  
E-mail from Mr. H. Rutten, dated 6 July 2016  
E-mail from Mr. R. Goyens, dated 11 July 2016  
E-mail from Mr. P. Ludford, dated 9 September 2016

8. The COMMITTEE noted that the silence procedure followed for the CNRCSA Bureau elections had not been broken and, in accordance with the Articles of Association, re-appointed Mr. H. Rutten ( Vice-Chairman) and Mr. E. Marquenie (Treasurer) for a two years' term of office.

9. The COMMITTEE noted that the following new members had been appointed by their parent Associations to sit on the CNRCSA Executive Committee: Mrs. I. Tezcan (ARNS), Mr. G. Malet (ARNS), Mr. R. Hickman (AROF), Mr. J-M Torrès (AROF), and Mr. L. Daykin (ANARCP). It also noted that Mr. J. Delor (ANARCP) had resigned, due to other commitments, and thanked him for his contributions.

10. The COMMITTEE formally appointed the following new Regional Representatives: Ms. A. Egribozlu (ANARCP) for Turkey, Mr. G. L. Thorsen (ANARCP) for Denmark, and Mr. G. Franzreb (ANARCP) for France.



11. The COMMITTEE took note of the resignations of Mrs. L. Hoffman-Jensen (ANARCP), Regional Representative for Denmark, and of Mr. R. Neitzel (ANARCP), Regional Representative for Germany. The Committee thanked them both for their invaluable work to the cause of NATO retirees and wished them well for the future. The Committee also noted that Mr. F. Bülling, in his capacity of Chairman of the CNRCSA WG on Policy Insurance Matters, would resign from this function end 2017. However, he would remain member of the ANARCP and the CNRCSA Executive Committees in accordance with the relevant regulations until 2020.

## V. FINANCIAL MATTERS

### (a) Draft 2017 Budget

12. The COMMITTEE took note of the verbal report by the Treasurer and approved, without comments, the 2017 budget as reproduced in a document distributed at the beginning of the meeting.

### (b) International Staff Subsidy for 2016

13. The COMMITTEE noted that the subsidy for 2016 (14,000 euros) had been approved by Executive Management and would be transferred to the CNRCSA bank account.

### (c) Call for contributions

References: E-mails from Mr. E. Marquenie, dated 30 June 2016

14. The COMMITTEE noted the Treasurer's statement indicating that all Associations had paid their contributions (2 Euros per member), with the exception of AROF for which banking arrangements needed to be finalized.

### (d) Meetings of the Associations' Treasurers held on 30 June and 4 October 2016

References: Oral report by the Treasurer  
E-mail from Mr. E. Marquenie, dated 29 September 2016  
E-mail from Mr. H. Rutten, dated 29 September 2016

15. The COMMITTEE took note of the verbal report by the Treasurer indicating that the meetings had focussed on the definition of the Treasurers' role, the sources of financing (contributions and IS subsidy), the management of incoming and outgoing funds, and the auditing procedures.

16. It was agreed that the Treasurers' meetings contributed to the harmonization of the Associations' accounting and auditing procedures, and the Treasurer was tasked to organize other meetings of the same kind (**Action 1**).

## VI. REORGANIZATION OF THE CNRCSA STRUCTURE AND WORKING METHODS

Reference: Report of the Ad Hoc Working Group, dated 11 September 2016

17. The COMMITTEE discussed the proposals made by the AHWG and agreed, with the unanimous support of the Associations' Chairmen, that it was needed to better react to the fast and complex NATO decision-making process and prevailing budget constraints, and also to provide an improved service and support to the increasing number of retirees who are joining the CNRCSA constituent Associations. For this purpose, efforts and resources should be centralized and the administration of the Associations should be streamlined to support the CNRCSA in the areas of budget and finance, public relations and website, administration and update of a centralized members' database. It was understood that each Association's autonomy should be maintained.

18. The COMMITTEE could support the following proposals:

(a) The Associations' membership forms should be harmonized under the heading of the CNRCSA.

(b) The Associations' membership fees should be set at the same level.

(c) The CNRCSA Secretariat should establish and update, with the help of the Associations' secretaries, a single membership data base.

19. The COMMITTEE tasked the Regional Representatives to provide their comments on the AHWG report (**Action 2**), and requested the AHWG to take the measures needed to implement the above proposals, with the involvement of the Treasurer, the Associations' secretaries and other knowledgeable volunteers, and to further discuss the feasibility of the proposals below:

(a) The CNRCSA should hold a yearly General Assembly of its four Associations' members where focal points on group insurance, pensions, and legal issues would present update reports.

(b) The ANARCP National Delegates' structure should merge with the CNRCSA Regional Representatives' structure. Financing of the latter travel and missions in the future should be sought through NATO (**Action 3**).

## VII. UPDATE ON HEALTH INSURANCE MATTERS

(a) Visit to AWC Brussels Headquarters on 4 July 2016

References: E-mails from Mr. F. Bülling, dated 28 June, 5 and 6 July 2016

20. The COMMITTEE noted that this item was raised pro memoria, as it had already been covered at its last meeting (see CNRCSA(2016)R/2, VII(i).

(b) NATO Group Insurance Contract 2017



References: E-mails from Mr. F. Bülling, dated 10 and 12 September 2016  
E-mail from Ms. M. Smets, dated 12 September 2016

21. The COMMITTEE noted that the re-written NGIC 2017 was pending approval by the Assistant Secretary General for Executive Management since December 2015. Despite several requests for clarification, NATO Personnel Support Services (NPSS) were unwilling to give further details. It should be noted that the re-written NGIC 2017 had not been co-ordinated with the CNRCSA, the CNCSC, the Advisory Panel on Administrative Matters and the JCB. NPSS considered this document was a management tool which did not require any coordination/consultation with a third party.

22. The COMMITTEE could not accept that the NGIC should be modified without consultation of or co-ordination with the JCB, and tasked its representatives to raise the matter at the next meeting of the JCB and of its Working Group on Insurance Matters (Action 4).

(c) NATO-wide Implementation Guidelines (NGIC)

23. The COMMITTEE noted that this document had been approved by the JCB in its initial version on 4 June 2013. Since then, NPSS had started implementing several amendments and changes which had been co-ordinated internally with AWC without being formally approved by the JCB.

24. The COMMITTEE tasked its representatives to request, at the next meetings of the JCB and of its WG on Insurance Matters, that the amended Guidelines be approved by the JCB (Action 5).

(d) NATO Benefit Guide 2016

References: E-mails from Mr. F. Bülling, dated 6 and 7 July, 25 August, and 3 September 2016  
E-mail from Ms. Y. Brems, dated 4 July 2016

25. The COMMITTEE noted that despite several reminders, NPSS had not changed its policy concerning the distribution of a hard copy of the Guide to all insured retirees, although promises had been made by AWC in December 2013 to do so.

(e) NATO-wide Supplementary Insurance (NWS)

26. The COMMITTEE noted that the JCB had agreed, at its last meeting, that NPSS would provide relevant data to the Confederation of NATO Civilian Staff Committees (CNCSC) to enable the policyholder to come forward with proposals for streamlining the NWS. The Committee regretted that these data would only be provided to the CNRCSA via the next JCB WG on Medical Insurance Matters and not directly.

(f) Primary Insurance

27. The COMMITTEE noted that NPSS and AWC had agreed in 2015 that the AWC database including all insured active and former staff members who were affiliated to another insurance was lacking completeness and should be updated. The Committee regretted that this had still not been followed up.

(g) Complaint procedure

References: E-mail from Mr. J.-M. Valkenberg, dated 12 July 2015  
E-mails from Mr. F. Bülling, dated 11 April 2012, 27 May, 28 June, 12 and 16 August 2016  
E-mail from Ms. E. De Cauwer, dated 20 May 2016  
E-mail from Ms. M. Smets, dated 11 August 2016

28. The COMMITTEE noted that the procedures to be followed for lodging a complaint against the claim handling service of AWC needed clarification. A complainant may avail himself, in present circumstances, of three possibilities: the internal system of AWC of which he is not fully aware, article 7 of the NGIC to which he has no access, and the complaint procedure mentioned in the CPRs. Which procedure takes precedence is not clear. The Committee tasked, therefore, its representatives to raise the matter at the next meeting of the relevant JCB Working Group (**Action 6**).

VIII. CHANGE TO FOOTNOTE TO ARTICLE 51.2 OF THE CPRs/COMPLAINT

References: English and French versions of the complaint, dated 27 May 2016  
E-mail from Mr. B. Roden, dated 6 July 2016

29. The COMMITTEE noted with deep concern that the complaint, financially supported by the CNRCSA, had been lodged on 28 May 2016 within the deadline set in the CPRs, but that the Secretary General had still not convened the Complaints Committee to deal with the matter.

IX. JOINT CONSULTATIVE BOARD

(a) JCB meeting held on 7 July 2016

Reference: Report by Mr. H. Rutten, CNRCSA Lead Representative to the JCB

30. The COMMITTEE took note of the report on the meeting, which was included in the reference file.



(b) JCB meeting to be held on 20 October 2016

Reference: JCB-A(2016)0003, dated 3 October 2016

31. The COMMITTEE agreed the CNRCSA position on the items that would be discussed at the next meeting of the JCB, i.e. defined contribution pension scheme, single salary spine, complaints and appeals procedure, and officially registered civil partnerships.

32. The COMMITTEE noted that the next JCB meeting would be chaired by the new DASG for Human Resources, Mr. P. Billaud-Durand, and tasked the Bureau to organize a first meeting with him and formally invite him to attend the next meeting of the Executive Committee (**Action 7**).

(c) JCB Working Group on Complaints and Appeals

References: Report by Mr. H. Rutten on the meeting held on 20 September 2016  
JCB-WP(2016)0003-REV1, dated 22 September 2016  
JCB-WP(2016)0008, dated 12 September 2016  
E-mail from Mr. B. Roden, dated 12 September 2016  
E-mail from Mr. H. Rutten, dated 12 September 2016  
JCB-WP(2016)0007, dated 1 September 2016  
Extract JCB record (JCB-R(2016)0002)  
Annual Report of the NATO Administrative Tribunal (2015)

33. The COMMITTEE took note of the report of the JCB Working Group and reaffirmed its position: failing an in-depth review of the NATO complaints and appeals procedures, which are basically flawed as far as retirees are concerned, the CNRCSA would plea for a return to the old system for retirees. Some NATO Administrations could support this position.

34. The COMMITTEE agreed, however, to work with the CNCSC which had made a good proposal aimed at doing away with Complaints Committees and replacing them with a conciliation process between all parties involved in a contested decision. Should conciliation fail, the matter would then be referred to an external judge, whose decision could be appealed against in an Appeals Board. This would provide NATO with a two-tier judicial system.

X. DEFINED CONTRIBUTION PENSIONS SCHEME (DCPS)

Reference: Pension Unit briefing on DCPS review (slides)

35. The COMMITTEE took note of the proposals that had been made by NATO to improve the DCPS and firmly supported the CNCSC which maintained that the proposed measures were far from sufficient to consider the DCPS a 'real' pension scheme and which requested that a real study be undertaken that should focus on the pension schemes in the eight reference national civil services and in other Coordinated Organisations, and should be based on a

defined benefits approach as was the case in the other Coordinated Organisations' new pension schemes.

#### XI. CNRCSA WEBSITE

References: Oral update report by Mr. M. Geeraerts, Website Team  
Paper on CNRCSA Website User Management  
E-mails from Mr. B. Roden, dated 6 and 20 July 2016  
E-mail from Mr. L. Daykin, dated 11 September 2016  
E-mail from Mr. A. Grant, dated 12 September 2016

36. The COMMITTEE was informed that the IT team managing the website would convene a meeting of all Associations' webmasters by Skype in November whose purpose would be to firm up a meaningful approach towards a common website policy, to define the process for updating users of the website, and to identify other issues that needed to be addressed.

#### XII. CNRCSA REGIONAL REPRESENTATIVES' ANNUAL REPORTS

References: Updated list of regional representatives  
E-mail from Mr. B. Roden, dated 3 August 2016

37. The COMMITTEE took note of the first annual reports of the CNRCSA Regional Representatives which indicated that pension taxation was the main issue they had to deal with in their respective countries.

38. The COMMITTEE tasked:

- the Bureau to designate deputy Regional Representatives (**Action 8**)
- the Secretary to re-issue the Regional Representatives' Terms of Reference (**Action 9**)
- each Association's secretary to provide Regional Representatives with an updated list of association's members residing in the countries for which they were competent (**Action 10**)

#### XIII. CCR-RELATED MATTERS

##### (a) Annual adjustment of remuneration at 1 January 2017

Reference: CRSG proposal (Annex 1 to CRSG/CRP/WD(2016)7, dated 12 September 2016)

39. The COMMITTEE noted that three nations in the NATO Council had broken silence on the CCR 2017 annual adjustment of remuneration proposal.

##### (b) New adjustment of remuneration method

Reference: CRP Review, dated July 2016



40. The Committee took note of the latest developments concerning the new method at the CCR level in which the nations initially proposed to include a moderation clause over and above the affordability clause. The CCR ultimately agreed to adopt a method for a period of four years without including a special moderation clause, provided that the three Committees committed themselves to “address the concerns expressed by a few CCR delegations that have difficulty in justifying in their capital the results of the application of the salary adjustment method” by June 2017. The CRP/CRSG could support this compromise solution.

#### XIV. AAPOCAD

- (a) Mr. V. Arzeni’s proposal to change the wording of the Co-ordinated Pension Scheme as included in the CPRs

References: Mr. V. Arzeni’s proposal  
E-mail from Mr. B. Roden, dated 1 October 2016

41. The COMMITTEE noted that its representatives sitting on AAPOCAD Governing Board, as tasked at the last meeting, had requested that the proposal be discussed at the next meeting of the Board. Members of the Board could not support the proposal which they considered to be risky and counter-productive at the time where the CCR was planning to review basic tenets of the 1974 Pension Scheme (tax adjustment among others). The Committee shared this position.

- (b) Conference of Pensioner’s Associations of International Organizations, Paris, 23-24 March 2017

References: AAPOCAD/BW/dc(2016)011, dated 30 June 2016  
E-mail from Mr. V. Arzeni, dated 12 July 2016

42. The COMMITTEE tasked the Bureau to select and appoint the CNRCSA representatives who would attend the Conference (**Action 11**).

#### XV. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

No questions were raised under this item.

#### XVI. DATE AND PLACE OF THE NEXT ENLARGED MEETING

To be determined.

Billy RODEN  
CNRCSA Secretary

Distribution

- Members of the Executive Committee
- Regional Representatives

After approval of the record:

- Chairman, Confederation of NATO Civilian Staff Committees (CNCSC)
- Mr. Wacquez, Chairman of AAPOCAD
- Mr. Bigaignon, Editor of the NATO Staff Bulletin

ANNEX A to  
CNRCSA(2016)R/3(REV1)

#### ATTENDANCE LIST

ARNS: E. Marquenie (Treasurer), P. Emmett, G. Malet, I. Tezcan  
B.Roden (Secretary), M. Geeraerts

ANARCP: F. Bülling, H.Rutten (Vice- Chairman), P. Ludford, J. Delor  
L. Daykin, K. van den Broek

NOBA: C. Baretti, O. Guidetti (Chairman), D. Schoder

AROF: J-M Torrès

REGIONAL REPRESENTATIVES: R. Neitzel, V. Arzeni, D. Manocha, J. Vanderwal,  
O. Guidetti, A. Egribozlu, L. Jensen, J.F. Eiken,  
G.I. Thorsen, T. Hammargren, P. Wilmotte, G. Franzreb,  
J. Batstra.



ANNEX B to  
CNRCSA(2016)R/3(REV1)

**LIST OF ACTION ITEMS**

<u>No./paragraph</u>	<u>Subject</u>	<u>By whom</u>
1/16	Organize other meetings with associations' treasurers	Treasurer
2/19	Provide comments on AHWG report	Regional Representatives
3/19	Examine additional proposals linked to CNRCSA re-organization	AHWG
4/22	Raise the issue of co-ordination of NGIC changes by JCB	CNRCSA representatives (JCB/JCB WG)
5/24	Request approval of NGIC implementation guidelines by JCB	CNRCSA representatives (JCB/JCB WG)
6/28	Request clarification on the complaints procedure to be followed in the NGIC context	CNRCSA representatives (JCB/JCB WG)
7/32	Request first meeting with the new DASG HR and invite him to the next Executive Committee meeting	Chairman
8/38	Designate deputy regional representatives	Bureau
9/38	Re-issue the regional representatives' TORs	Secretary
10/38	Provide regional representatives with updated lists of associations' members	Associations' secretaries

<u>No./paragraph</u>	<u>Subject</u>	<u>By whom</u>
11/42	Select and appoint CNRCSA representatives to AAPOCAD Conference	Bureau